



2015

**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**  
**Plans Review Subcommittee**

**LEGAL ACTION REPORT**

**Thursday, August 27, 2015,**  
**4<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,**  
**101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701**

**1. Call to Order / Roll Call:**

Meeting called to session at 1:03 PM

Commissioners: Patsy Waterfall (Acting Chair), Sharon Chadwick, Jim Sauer, Helen Erickson

Staff: Michael Taku, Alexandra Hines, John Beall (PDSD), Jennifer Levstik, Jonathan Mabry, Lynne Birkinbine (OIP), Elaine Bercherer (CMO)

**2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 7-23-15**

Motion by Commissioner Chadwick to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 7-23-15. Motion seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

**3. Courtesy Review Cases**

- a. TPAC 5 Points Art Project** - Tucson Pima Arts Council - Discuss Final Art Design - 10 East Broadway #106

Mary Ellen Wooten and Jeff De Costa presented the proposal.

Commissioner Erickson asked how the reliefs would be mounted. Ms. Wooten replied that the reliefs would be secure and better mounting than the fire station reliefs.

- b. **January 8<sup>th</sup> Memorial Project** - Tucson Pima Arts Council - Public Outreach Planning Process - Discuss Historic Aspects of the Memorial on the El Presidio Park Site

Mary Ellen Wooten presented the proposal. Ms. Wooten requested three volunteers/participants from T-PCHC PRS. Commissioner Sauer asked about the time commitment. Ms. Wooten explained that six focus groups would participate in one meeting a month for two hours over a 3-4 month period.

Commissioner Erickson asked if there is a deadline to participate. Ms. Wooten said the group is coming September 9<sup>th</sup>.

Staff Mabry asked that the applicant update and maintain communication with the Historic Preservation Office. Staff Mabry noted that the next full T-PCHC meeting is September 9<sup>th</sup> and the T-PCHC PRS meeting is September 10<sup>th</sup>.

#### 4. **Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

- a. **HPZ-15-37** - Roth Residence - Replacement Windows/Paint/Mechanical [Pending Zoning Violation] -1031 North 3rd Avenue (West University) Formal Vote/Action.

Staff Taku provided background. Applicant not present.

Motion by Commissioner Sauer to recommend denying the proposal to maintain existing windows. Seconded by Commissioner Erickson.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

- b. **HPZ-15-57** - Clinco Residence - Detached Carport with Solar Panels - 5495 East Fort Lowell Road (Fort Lowell)

Applicant not present. Case is going to Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board (FLHZAB). Case will be set for a future date on the T-PCHC PRS agenda.

- c. **HPZ-15-61** - Smith - Existing Front Porch Enclosure [Pending Zoning Violation, T12SA00261 & HPZ-12-30] - Proposed New Front Porch Addition - 600 East Speedway Boulevard (West University)

Staff Taku provided background and read the West University Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) legal action report into the record with a recommendation to deny the proposal.

Earl Yousey IV, Architect, presented on behalf of the property owner, Smith. Mr. Yousey noted that the open porch is a security issue. Mr.

Yousey noted the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) said the enclosed porch would not hurt the contributing status of the property.

Staff Taku stated that the property was rezoned from residential to Office zoning and per a rezoning condition the building square footage cannot be expanded. He explained that the SHPO letter stated that it had little influence over Design review in the City of Tucson. Additionally, that the local ordinances and local historic district guidelines shall be observed and respected as part of the HPZ review process. Staff Mabry specified that porches cannot be enclosed as noted in the West University Guidelines.

Motion by Commissioner Chadwick to recommend denying the proposal of new front porch addition and to return the front porch to its original condition per previous recommendations. Seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

## **5. Rio Nuevo District Review Cases**

- a. RND-15-08** - Eckbo Landscape - TCC Today - Replacement Wood for the Eckbo Benches - 180 & 260 South Church Avenue

Commissioner Sauer recused himself from the case.

Staff Taku let the commissioners know that the case cannot be heard because there is not a quorum. Commissioner Erickson requested for the project to be conducted as a minor review. Staff scheduled a minor review for 8/28/15.

- b. RND-15-20** - The Permanent Reconstruction Plan for the Former Grill Building/New Vanilla Shell Building - New Construction, New Storefront System, Stucco, New Transom Glass, Windows and Doors - 100 East Congress Street.

Project presented by Page Repp, Architect. He summarized the proposed plan for the new Vanilla Shell Building as including an internal support structure, new concrete floor, new bathrooms, new electrical service and a five ton mechanical unit; removing the stucco on the north façade and exposing the existing bricks underneath it; damaged architectural detailing replaced with bent, mild steel, sheet metal to match available historic photos; new store front to have two new doors and new glazing; new transom glass will be added to match existing adjacent building and new construction on south façade will be a block wall with brick veneer as well as windows and door to match existing buildings.

Staff Taku provided background on the project stating that the plan is for a permanent abatement of a pending Building Code violation on the property. He added that the project had been reviewed and recommended

for approval by the Design Review Board (DRB) on 8/21/15. Staff Mabry assured that Commissioners that the brick that were revealed appeared to be in good shape.

Commissioner Sauer questioned if the proposal is a restoration or a false sense of history. Staff Mabry noted that the proposal could have detailed elements that make the building contemporary, but compatible.

Motion by Commissioner Chadwick to recommend approval of the project as presented with work described on the plans and return to T-PCHC PRS with significant changes. Seconded by Commissioner Erickson.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

**6. Historic Landmark Review Case:**

- a. HL-15-01**—"El Con Water Tower" Historic Landmark-Repairs/Maintenance/Rehabilitation-136 South Randolph Way.

Staff Levstik provided background and history of the El Con Water Tower. Jon Mirto, Architect from Poster Frost Mirto, presented the proposal.

Motion by Commissioner Sauer to recommend approval of the project as presented with work described on the plans. Seconded by Commissioner Erickson.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

- b. HL-15-02** "Broadway Village Shopping Center" Historic Landmark- Tucson First Shopping Center: Renovations/Repairs /Addition, 3016 East Broadway Boulevard.

Staff Mabry provided background of the case and noted that the property inventory and character defining features will be provided by the applicant. Staff John Beall, from Rezoning at PDSD, provided input noting that applicants are required as a condition of rezoning to submit for review and recommendation to the T-PCHC (PRS) prior to scheduling the Zoning Examiner Public Hearing for rezoning the adjacent parcel to a parking lot.

The applicants, Fred Howard and Rick Huch, presented the proposal to include minor modifications to the south elevation with an entrance to the store; improve interior layout; enclosed windows; and removal and infill of doors.

Commissioner Erickson requested that the alteration be shown by a reveal or indentation from the original plane of the wall. Staff Mabry noted that the proposal should not create a false sense of historic fabric.

Motion by Commissioner Erickson to recommend approval of the project as presented with condition that enclosed areas have a recess in the façade to distinguish the new construction. Seconded by Commissioner Sauer.

Motion passed. Vote 4-0.

**7. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:**

**a. Minor Reviews**

Staff Taku updated Subcommittee on minor reviews conducted last Friday. On Friday, August 28, minor reviews will be held with Commissioner Erickson.

**b. Appeals**

Nothing at this time.

**c. Zoning Violations**

Staff continues to assist on abatement of violations in the Historic Districts.

**8. Call to the Audience**

Staff from TCC Today spoke on the continuing work on the Eckbo Landscape.

**9. Future Items**

Commissioner Erickson requested that changes or proposals of the Broadway Boulevard Corridor be presented to the T-PCHC PRS.

**10. Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 2:40 p.m.